Engaging with News

Indicators of Trustworthiness

Interviews and Integration

Chris Kurjan, Quiver Consulting

February / March 2016

For The Trust Project

Markkula Center for Applied Ethics

Santa Clara University, CA
Engagement
• Activated, Using News, Informed, Entertained
• Disengaged, Repelled

Interview Summaries
• Wendy
• Rodale
• Kalah
• Alessandro & Jayson
• Alex(andria)
• Alma
• Loren
• Hossannah
• Brandon
• Graham
• Other faces
• Composite late-20’s news cynic
Activated

“I do not understand why people do not read the news. Might as well put your finger in a light socket.” (It’s that dangerous to be uninformed.)

Using the News

At the library, “we are an equal opportunity offender.”

“Empathy and the personal aspect make news real.”

Social news. Looking for local Impact

Looking for nutritionally fit news.

Informed

Social news. Looking for local Impact

“Empathy and the personal aspect make news real.”

Active

“Informed Decision-making

“News trustworthiness is a completely subtractive experience.”

“Empathy and the personal aspect make news real.”

Values are clear, formatting and multiple perspectives.

Disengaged

“Intercepts” in restaurants, museums, bars, receptions, airplanes and airports.

Repelled

Wishes she weren’t too busy to keep up well.

“How did this story get built?”

“Activated” using the news.

Informed

Whose needs is the news ultimately satisfying?

“I do not understand why people do not read the news. Might as well put your finger in a light socket.” (It’s that dangerous to be uninformed.)

Disengaged

“I do not understand why people do not read the news. Might as well put your finger in a light socket.” (It’s that dangerous to be uninformed.)

Repelled

“Intercepts” in restaurants, museums, bars, receptions, airplanes and airports.
Activated
- I curate my own news
- For work or my / our benefit or safety
- News is something we do
  - This is about my / our
    - family, race or education
    - commitment to a culture

Using the News

Informed
- Conversation with colleagues or friends
- Connection to the world

Interested
- Catches my attention

Entertained
- It’s a diversion...
  - from interaction and action
  - from boredom
  - from an aligned/centered life

Taking a Break from News

Disengaged
- Too negative
- Too much negative
- Overwhelming
- Biased
- Crazy
- Lies
- Apathy
  - I don’t have a stake/voice.
    (Almost all interviewees say this, but it’s a driver for the Disengaged.)

Repelled
- There’s nothing there -- no relevance
- Don’t even want to discuss or think about it

Feelings
- Guilt?
- Anger?

* All are quoted words from interviews except those in gray.
What Can We Offer Across the Engagement Spectrum?
(All the ages we consulted, including 28 to 42 year olds, range across the spectrum.)

Summary thoughts and suggestions by Christine Kurjan

Activated
• Allow them to continue setting their own standards; feel in control.
• Help them share their thing, their passion
• Shine light on the “Why aren’t they (those other folks) reading?” question. Help us think about the disengaged.
• Provide a means to interact more deeply with the maps that others (just) see (ref to maps below)
• Engage them to lead

Informed
• Refine their approach to / model of being informed. This could come as a holistic guidance piece or in the feed.
• Outline or highlight the gray zone between informed, using and active. Where do they think they are, how might that change or develop? What’s appropriate for “the news” to do in their experience of it? (Is news just about being informed? Or does it lead to action beyond sharing and discussing.)
• Help them visualize how news sources align with what they are looking for.
• Illustrate the map of stances on a topic and where an article lies on it.
• Connect them to alternative viewpoints and expect them to click through 5% of the time/when they have time, just so they stay abreast of what everyone’s saying. Many like to do this, even when they find the alt-view aggravating.

Occasional
• Offer modes that they can choose from at every access opportunity. Examples: Headlined. Alt Views. Locals.
• Allow them to map their surf activity and plot their Interests. (like Apple Music)
• Slowly initiate them into little bits of Active or Informed behavior.
• Offer a tool: How might we “see” who influences us?

Disengaged
• Prove that a constructive, unbiased approach is possible and how being informed can make a difference.
• Offer a map of relevance and interest.
• Suggest something they can do in 5-10 minutes.
• Learn/steal from reality TV programming

Repelled
• Both ends of our spectrum (Activated and Repelled) want to see a dramatic admission before moving on – a statement of “Yes, It’s Become Crap / Is a Mess.” Sort of like a Truth and Reconciliation Commission. It really is beyond a promise, claim, or a seal of approval, and maybe even beyond a grading feature or service. The latter might work, but not until after the mea culpa. People want to see an admission of current circumstances at the very least.
How might we connect Wendy to her trusted locals, whether local to her or elsewhere around the globe? (for confirmation and local connection)

**Indicators/Tools of Trust**

- Link to byline
- Eye-witness
- Feedback to author
- User trust rating in browser extension
- (FRIENDs’) share-ranking

“News is there to let us know what’s going on? Around the world. Around the neighborhood. But I’d like for it to be more real. Not just selling a viewpoint or a person.”

- Wants more news / less violence.
- Wants news that “helps us do better locally.” (In our parlance: “News I can act on.”)
- Connects news with family and culture.
- Uses news to take action on family well-being.

**Local Impact**

“Whether you think so or not, you’re influenced by others.”

ocsupydemocrats.com

wearemitu.com

mixie cultural art

More active sharing may mean friends recommendations are important.

HMW, as an industry, engage neighborhoods in their own local stories and local improvement?
Wendy’s Daily News Journey at age 35

Naptime! 10am

MiTu.com

FaceBook @ break

Baby to bed 8pm

Univision

MiTu.com

Face Book

5-6pm 7-10pm
“News is the re-telling of a story. Sometimes from a more biased point of view: ‘We’re telling our story to you.’ “

“News should [make you] aware of what’s happening. So I can see how to improve my life and the people around me.”

**Indicators/Tools of Trust**

- Disclosure of conflicts of interest
- Willingness to hold power accountable
- Statement re: objectivity/agenda per topic
- Original reporting
- Reporting methodology
- Menu of news sources on topic
- Link to byline with expertise, history, affil.

**How much does Rodale trust news items he’s reading, in general?**

*About 60%.*

Some of the more vocal, “biased” pieces are down at 10%

The best you can expect is 60% trustworthy

The credibility of any source (publisher, author, broadcaster, website) is undermined at a minimum by:

- personal perspective
- desire/motive
- level of experience
- error

---

**Indicators/Tools of Trust**

- Disclosure of conflicts of interest
- Willingness to hold power accountable
- Statement re: objectivity/agenda per topic
- Original reporting
- Reporting methodology
- Menu of news sources on topic
- Link to byline with expertise, history, affil.

**How might we map or visualize the landscape of perspectives on a topic?**

Or of sources used?

**HMW see alternate viewpoints?**

**Words are important: Promise is hollow, and action means many things.**
Grandparents’ Daily News Journey

Morning in bed
I ask: Why are we all doing this now?
R: Because it has our alarm, too.

Rodale’s Daily News Journey

Phone
Tablet
Lunch break

Evenings

Santa Clara University
Merkula Center for Applied Ethics
News sources are human, so we expect them to have a perspective.

6 Words on News:

“Empathy ...and the personal aspect... make news real.”

Indicators/Tools of Trust

• Describe why author chose issue
• Distinguish news, analysis, opinion
• User interacts with site: feedback, corrections
• Algorithm puts best sources into story body
• User can suggest diversity-related sources
• Apps to aggregate news with many citations

How might we map or visualize who the reader is in comparison to those included or interviewed in story.

HMW show where this story is, in general in the media, in its development.
Does news lead to action?
“Not much personally. News is) s a knowledge-gaining experience, a way to deepen awareness and empathy. News can bring humility, positioning my troubles on the map of the world.”

Kalah agreed to track some of her news intake before we met.

2/24
Listened to the Republican Debate on NPR.
She’s interested in hearing the commentary and predictions about upcoming coverage.
Confidence Level: Very confident – trusts NPR and it’s more speculation than a story.

2/25
Read about the Johnson & Johnson lawsuit and viewed it on the L.A. Times website.
She’s interested because she’s curious how the lawsuit proved the cancer connection and she feels connected with the American Cancer Society.
Confidence Level: Pretty confident, but the story seems to be missing some sides.

2/25
Viewed the tornadoes in the Midwest on The Skimm.
She’s interested because her family is in the Midwest and she’s wondering where the tornadoes are.
Confidence Level: Somewhat confident – unsure of how detailed the report would be about specific areas.

2/26
Viewed a story about sexual assault laws on Facebook / The Guardian.
She’s interested because she’s curious how someone her age is influencing a Senate bill.
Confidence Level: Very confident – tells the story well.
Late 30s, PHX

The ads make it less credible... if these people are willing to take money from [disreputable and low value places], then it reflects back poorly.

**Indicators of Trust**
- User trust profile
- Breaking news
- Updates option to follow
- Semantic analysis based on ‘temp’ (grammar, etc.)
- Geo-ref on story location
- Personalized email push
- Collect international news sources on hot topics
- Cards / layers of info
- Churnalism ranking
- Badges / flags for deeper content

HMW ...create an engaging user experience around curating our news?

HMW ... chart the timeline of a publisher as it changes ownership/focus?

We need a new approach to advertising + news online.
27 Feb 2016

Alessandro & Jayson

Excerpted Images

- Home control notification
- Zillow push
- Community water message
- Breaking election news
- Bills

- Cancel Showtime on iTunes
- NYT on Repub and Trump
- Bill alert
- Dictionary push: learning bite
- Cancel AT&T membership
- Household calendar note
- Home controls notification
News notification ➔ CNN Politics
Ex-AG Alberto Gonzales endorses Kasich

His phone feed is from:
• OFFER UP – Want to sell stuff?
• ZILLOW – A push notification
Apple Music Profile

• Tell us what you’re into.
• Tap once on the genres you like, or twice on the ones you love. Press and hold the ones you don’t.

→ Bigger circles for Electronica, Indie and Alternative. Smaller ones for Hits and Rock.

• Choose your favorites.
• Same instructions.
• In both panels, the bubbles float by, balancing lively with soothing, as they help you manage your listening.
• A fun way to build a profile. Doesn’t have to be done all at once.
How might we ...take “Bunny Fuego” to the next level as a DJ of News, Ethics and Lifestyle: News accessible to those not seeing it?

HMW ...chart the timeline of a publisher as it changes ownership/values?

Navigates her news through Twitter, heavily and interactively. “I keep it clean and curated.” She posts generally there and on music elsewhere. Wants to know all the news and form an opinion. Wants publishers to be accountable. “I know the sculptor of the news.”

Indicators/Tools of Trust
• Tool to support user as curator
• Provide new source/topic each day
• User can suggest diversity-related sources
• Willingness to hold power accountable
• Local reporting: topic timeline, author location
• Enterprise reporting
• Verification tool to flag inconsistencies
• Social fact-checking tool

How might we chart the timeline of a publisher as it changes ownership/values?
Daily News Journey... and more!
Indicators/Tools of Trust

- Easy-access editorial guidelines, owner, funding sources
- Link to byline
- Geo-ref on story location
- Local reporting – increase context
- History or notation of fact-checking
- Links to content on same topic: (ALTERNATE VIEWS)
- Friend share ranking
- Organize meet-ups / coffee chats
- Tool for avid news sharers
- Verification tool to flag inconsistencies

HMW create an infographic around how local an item or source is?

HMW connect readers, viewers and listeners to alternate viewpoints?

6 Words on News
Information. Constant.

The level of political discourse in her family growing up was high. Mother went to Spellman and Dad was in United Auto Workers.

Alma gets the news across multiple digital devices all through the day: TV and tablet with coffee in the morning; radio while driving; notifications all day from Freep, NYT, ClickOnDetroit, weather... and winds down at night with TV and cable. She still gets the Detroit Free Press on Sundays for the feel of newspaper on the weekend.

“We are an equal opportunity offender: if nothing offends you, we aren’t doing our job.”

“We are an equal opportunity offender: if nothing offends you, we aren’t doing our job.”
When we look at the shape of a digital article and discuss what might enhance it for her:

- She feels the publisher is a known, reputable source to her already.
- She, like others, loves the idea of the author link with years of experience, who they’ve worked for, special interests, other writings, and a declaration of some sort.
- She’s interested in knowing how local the story is to her and understanding how it relates to her.
- She wants to see sources called out in each piece and would unroll embedded footnotes if she had time.
- She wants to know who stands behind the news? Who backs it up?
- Links at the bottom could show her other points of view and other papers.
Indicators of Trust

- Reporting methodology with CMS functionality
- Citations and reference links
- History or notation of fact-checking
- Apps to aggregate news with a lot of citations
- Further reading on topic with ALT VIEWS
- (Non)Churnalism ranking

How might we see a citation timeline or otherwise signal early credible sources on a topic?

“News trustworthiness is a completely subtractive experience.”

6 Words on News
Automated doesn’t make me trust it any more.

“The only source I trust.”

...recommended to Loren today along with Ethereum, quantum computing and foosball.
5-7am
Read... then sleep a little more.

NHK @ noon. Every hour, their anthem.

Al Jazeera US

What is the News?
- **diploma** = academic weight
- **microscope** = scientific
- **magnifier** = small things, critical view
- **masks** = theater
- **satellites** = 1 for us to see the news through... 1 to watch us
- **people** = a million people’s view
38, NYC
“Easily annoyed.” ;)
in the context of news format and content

“So we’re trying to develop standards? I like transparency. (With a cat video now and then.)”

More Quotes:

“What are the new journalism ethics?” she asked. How can citizens be represented in some way? Who is a good representative of the people?”

“News is one way for getting information and responding.”

“I would trust a system that was as critical of institutions as I am.”

6 Words on News
Journalism: [Ideally]
Fourth branch of “Checks & Balance.”

“News is one way for getting info and responding.”

Scales mean “Whose needs are the news ultimately trying to satisfy?” Human hand designs and supports the system.

Indicators of Trust
- Ombudsperson
- Ethics policy
- Disclosure of conflicts of interest
- Easily accessible editorial guidelines, company ownership, funding sources
- Diversity policy
- Objectivity agenda on any given topic
- Semantic analysis based on “temperature”
- Good grammar, spelling, writing.

What if we had a nice interactive card-sort to gather user preferences?
Above – Her Facebook today.  
Paul Ocampo via Angry Asian Man
Hossannah trusts Angry Asian Man for critiques related to Asian American culture. She reposted the org’s statement.

She doesn’t like reading on the Facebook app (due to tracking) and instead moves onto the news site itself.

FaceBook is good for seeing what her network shares, especially her writer friends, and covers lots of life perspectives. I ask about FB vs Twitter and she says, “Nahhh” to Twitter. “But when Sandy hit...!” It’s certainly valuable in particular ways.
Brandon, a D.C. lobbyist turned Detroit art-center entrepreneur, outlined both an emblem of his personal news values and an infographic with measurements for each article.

How might users brand themselves?
(Nutritional News. Diverse Voices. Just the Facts, Ma’am...)

What’s Important: Brandon’s Emblem

6+ Words on News
Fact-based updates.
Informed perspective.
Events on national / global scale.

Brandon,
Black Male

“...nutritionally fit.”

Indicators/Tools of Trust
• History or notation of fact-checking
• Updates: Option to follow / be notified of relevant articles or updates. Or option to follow the issue.
• Social crowd score of author’s social media activity
• Social share-ranking of story
• Corrections policy and practices
• Details of corrections
• History of versions of articles
• Further reading – links to content on same story
• Original reporting
• Diversity policy

How might we roadmap the daily news and signal its trustworthiness?
His FB-framed news day starts and ends lying down, as many reported.

Brandon also started to draft an infographic to accompany an article, showing where the news is, what information resources could be linked, plus the number of friends and unknowns recommending it.

Newsfeed includes:

- HuffPost Black Voices” on Oscar racism
- “White Supremacists Mobilize”
- NYT on Google’s learnings about teams
- Mark Zuckerberg demanding employees stop crossing out “black lives matter” in favor of “all lives matter” on murals.

Facebook page and post for Brandon’s CanvasXDetroit Art-for-Everyone business.
Graham, White ExPat

24 Feb 2016

54, DTW-NY

“Every time I read an article, I have more questions.”

6 Words on News
Who’s behind it? (Who is author?)
What’s beyond it? (Further info, research)

Feels news is about 80% trustworthy.

Other quotes:
• Comes from a family where “my father reads like a job!”
• Trusts BBC, NPR, NBC’s Lester Holt, CBS “60 Minutes.”
• Local news is “trying to be your friend.” “I don’t need drama or personal inflection.”
• Puts faith in the author, once known. “Look! It’s Bill, known him for years.” “Even the old-time, legitimate newspapers might be written by complete unknowns.”
• “Wikipedia isn’t worth the paper it’s written on.”

Indicators/Tools of Trust
• Author bio linked to byline
• Network of links and citations that lead to author’s work in other locations
• Citations and references: Include precise links to original documents
• Further reading: Cite other news sources on same topic or on user-selected topics
• Further reading: Links to content about the same topic

How might we diagram the authors Graham trusts and lead him to articles with opposite perspectives or opinions using automation or user interaction?

In what ways might we link Graham to purchasable services or products for education and learning?
Graham, White ExPat

Date 24 Feb 2016

Graham’s Proposal for an Ideal Article Format

Graham’s ideal article is a 5- to 10-minute read with additional factoids bulleted to the side for further inquiry. He can simply grab from the text to share it. At the bottom he wants to see what other readers are reading, alternate news sources and points of view. For him, suitable action following news reading is to go further in-depth on a subject area, buy a book or otherwise learn more deeply, so a link to further actions like these at the bottom would be good. (This didn’t feel like advertising, particularly, to him.)

As an example of what action means for him, he points to the Flint, Michigan, lead-in-water crisis and reporting. Through a bit more searching, he learned about the history of the town and lead, the physics and physiology of lead... and then found that other towns in the U.S. have similar problems that haven’t been reported on. “Every time I read an article, I have more questions.” Wikipedia is definitively not on his trusted list of research sources.
David - New Jersey

Less Digital. Reads paper format of “The Week.” Trusts it because it’s recommended by his brother-in-law who’s in publishing. He values the clear formatting and multiple perspectives on issues.

He also looks on Facebook. David has his own small business promoting Neal’s Yard products, which may be bringing him into the digital realm for news.

Karen - Detroit

Very Busy. News reading was very important to her family growing up and remains so now. Wishes she had more time.